

## **APPENDIX A**

---

### Public Outreach Summary

## **APPENDIX A. PUBLIC OUTREACH SUMMARY**

A public meeting was held in Loyalton on November 14, 2007 to brief the community on the Land Management Plan (LMP) for the Antelope Valley Wildlife Area (AVWA) and Smithneck Creek Wildlife Area (SCWA) and to receive comments from the community on the LMP. This appendix includes a summary of the public comments that were received.

Additional public comments received on the Draft LMP and accompanying initial study/negative declaration (IS/ND) will be included in the Final LMP.

# Antelope Valley and Smithneck Creek

## Land Management Plan

### Public Meeting, November 14, 2007 Public Comments

#### Participants

A total of 16 public participants were present at the meeting (14 signed in). Responses to some comments were provided by Jim Lidberg (Wildlife Area Manager, DFG), Randy Westmoreland (Hydrologist, USFS), and Ron Unger (Project Director, EDAW).

#### Oral Comments Received at Public Meeting

- Vallea Rose (self) – Once restored, will the Wildlife Areas be closed to the public?
  - Jim Lidberg – No, the Wildlife Area will remain open.
- Will roads be closed to OHV's?
  - Jim Lidberg – looking for middle ground solution to regulation (new regulation that forbids the use of OHVs if they are not expressly allowed)
- Lee Pinson (self) – I was here during last two floods. USFS needs to do something about downed wood in Bear Valley. Dead and fallen trees will cause log jams that will create problems during floods. This is also a problem on Smithneck Creek.
  - Randy Westmoreland – Restoration of Bear Valley Creek would help by spreading floodwater over a larger area in the meadow.
- Gale Dupree (self) – (topic: Fire Management) Forest along Bear Valley Road (where it is leaving the Sierra Brooks area) needs thinning for fire protection.
  - If there are no off highway vehicles (OHVs) allowed on DFG property, then signs should be posted, people will be using Bear Valley Road, etc.
    - Jim Lidberg – new regulations regarding OHV use on Wildlife Areas have gone into effect and signs will be posted.
- Vallea Rose – Where's the funding for LMP and implementation coming from?
  - Jim Lidberg – funding for implementation will be coming from grants; funding for the LMP came from Wildlife Conservation Board funds originating from Proposition 40.
- Jeff Vasey (self) – I have been here 1 and ½ years. What's the long-term change in creeks? Why do all these restoration activities? People now ride all terrain vehicles (ATVs), ride horses, walk dogs. You are trying to make changes for the better, but it doesn't seem that this will improve things. You need to address Smithneck Creek – that's where damage will be done.
  - Jim Lidberg – We can't address Smithneck Creek because DFG doesn't own the land along it. We will improve wildlife values in areas we own. Loyaltan and Sierra Brooks are affected by problems of Smithneck Creek. It needs help and resources.
  - Randy Westmoreland – changes have occurred, including erosion in Smithneck Creek. People can contact Randy to get more information.

- Jim Smith (Feather River Archery Club) – Restoration of Bear Valley Creek will reduce flows to Smithneck Creek.
- Jeff Vasey – Serious erosion at Antelope Valley Creek, downstream and just upstream from Palen Reservoir.
  - Jim Lidberg – We are talking with the private land owners along Antelope Valley Creek and are trying to get their concurrence [for watershed improvements]. We are trying to address their concerns about costs, etc. They will not be saddled with the cost.
- Jim Lochridge (self) – I ride an ATV on the road to the woods. I would like amenities for ATVs (including motorized trails) and also amenities for hiking. DFG should make concessions for water crossings; make a water crossing that works for horses and ATV's, to provide access to these areas. If there are adverse effects of restoration – like flooding – who is the responsible party?
  - Randy Westmoreland – DFG can answer; we don't anticipate adverse effects. On USFS land the USFS will be responsible.
- Jim Lochridge – Will comments be included and addressed in the LMP/CEQA?
  - Ron Unger – Yes, comments will be addressed in the LMP/CEQA document.
- Jim Lochridge – Where will draft documents be available?
  - Ron Unger – Documents will be available in the local library, probably also at the Sierraville Tahoe National Forest Ranger Station.
- Marilyn Tierney (Sierra County Fish & Game Commission) – Since these areas were purchased for deer herd protection, consider areas and times where deer need protection when planning for public uses (e.g., OHV use vs. deer, herd/timing and deer herd disturbance).
- Marilyn Tierney – Plug-and-pond restoration projects have been very successful. I am very supportive of the plug-and-pond restoration project. The plug-and-pond restoration will disperse energy and restore vegetation.
- Jim Lochridge – This group may be interested in visiting restoration projects on the Tahoe National Forest, such as the Carman Valley Project.
  - Randy Westmoreland – Willing to give a tour to this group, will provide notice of a tour to the group.
- Vallea Rose – Will/can public comments be posted on the web?
  - Jim Lidberg – will check if and how comments can be posted, DFG may need to take privacy issues in consideration.
- Jim Smith (topic: Watershed Restoration) – Area north of Antelope Fork and Bear Valley Fork intersection should also be restored. Will impact of Hastings [Harding] fire erosion be considered in plug and pond restoration of Antelope Valley Creek – concern that erosion could wipe out restoration work.
  - Randy Westmoreland – yes, restoration would address potential for erosion after fire, such as has occurred after the Harding Fire (e.g., storm in 2006 that dropped 3 inches rain in 20 min). Erosion causes natural fill and complementary fill of gullies occurs after storm.

- Jeff Vasey – No offense to the Archery Club- DFG lets them do what they want, has no worries about what they do - but what about other activities? To say OHV, horse, hiking trail use is destructive is overkill – the situation is not as dire as DFG wants us to believe. I can understand not wanting OHV use in meadows. How will enforcement occur? Saw DFG person once in 1.5 years here. Witnessed deer killings in woods for no reason.
- Vallea Rose – How much will restoration and LMP cost?
  - Randy Westmoreland – Bear Valley restoration \$400,000-500,000 (not costed out yet); perhaps \$1,000,000 for both sites.
- Jeff Vasey – What is the plan for existing trails? What is the plan for the Bear Valley Creek area around houses – 1 mile plus or minus from houses. If section is flooded, people will still want use the trails. Provide continued trail use.

## Written Comments Received at Public Meeting

### Marilyn Tierney (Sierra County Fish and Game Commission):

Just info: Bat biologist (Contact Dr. Joe Szewczak, Humboldt State University (707)834-1932) has bat occurrence data for Antelope Valley Creek (mist netted in ~1997 and possibly annually through present). Also has monitoring data at Carmen Valley. I will send his e-mail to you.

Good watershed projects.

Re: LMP – would like to see management favor restoring and maintaining wildlife over some public uses; if uses are not compatible, i.e., How much OHV use is too much? Consider developing trigger points or thresholds that may initiate different management that may account for increased recreational use over time.

### Gale Dupree (Sierra Brooks Homeowners):

Include thinning of young pines along Bear Valley Road adjoining Sierra Brooks.  
[WP Please ADD COMMENT FORMS from separate file]



# Antelope Valley and Smithneck Creek Wildlife Areas Land Management Plan

## Draft Land Management Plan and Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration PUBLIC COMMENTS

*(please hand in or mail back by December 5, 2007)*

Name: Marilyn Tierney

Organization (if any): Sierra County Fish and Game Commission

Address (optional) : P.O. Box 554

City, State, Zip: Downieville, CA 95936

E-Mail: mtierney@fs.fed.us

---

The California Department of Fish and Game (DFG) is preparing a Land Management Plan and an Initial Study (IS) for the Antelope Valley and Smithneck Creek Wildlife Areas. DFG invites you to provide specific comments on the scope of issues or topics to be addressed in the Land Management Plan.

If there is information which you believe should be incorporated into the Land Management Plan, or if you have any comments, please provide them below. Thank you!

### Comments

Just info: Bat biologist (Contact Dr. Joe Szewczak, Humboldt State University (707)834-1932) has bat occurrence data for Antelope Valley Creek (mist netted in ~1997 and possibly annually through present). Also has monitoring data at Carmen Valley. I will send his e-mail to you.

Good watershed projects.

Re: LMP – would like to see management favor restoring and maintaining wildlife over some public uses; if uses are not compatible, ie. How much OHV use is too much? Consider developing trigger points or thresholds that may initiate different management that may account for increased recreational use over time.



Include thinning of young pines along Bear Valley Road adjoining Sierra brooks.







# Antelope Valley and Smithneck Creek Wildlife Areas Land Management Plan

## Draft Land Management Plan and Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration PUBLIC COMMENTS

*(please hand in or mail back by December 5, 2007)*

Name: Jeff Vasey

Organization (if any): \_\_\_\_\_

Address (optional) : P.O. Box 1112 OR P.O. Box 454

City, State, Zip: Loyalton, CA 96118 Tahoma, CA 96142

E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_

---

The California Department of Fish and Game (DFG) is preparing a Land Management Plan and an Initial Study (IS) for the Antelope Valley and Smithneck Creek Wildlife Areas. DFG invites you to provide specific comments on the scope of issues or topics to be addressed in the Land Management Plan.

If there is information which you believe should be incorporated into the Land Management Plan, or if you have any comments, please provide them below. Thank you!

### Comments

I attended the well put together informational meeting on 11/14/07 at the Loy. Elem. School. Lots of comments were made and my impression that no one was really stressed out by the installation of coffer dams and such, as long as the Area remained open to hiking, dog walks, equestrian access etc. OHV use was brought up and to be honest except for some neighborhood kids, most OHV use is to simply pass through from the Sierra Brooks Subdivision to access Bear Valley Road and beyond. Another possible topic was increased mosquito issues due to standing water and if fish would be able to swim upstream or would they be inhibited. All in all as long as the area keeps public access similar to what exists and leaves areas to cross Bear Valley Creek at occasional spots, I don't see anyone trying to stop what actually could turn out to be a good thing.

Good luck in your quest and happy Holidays to all of you

Thanks, Jeff Vasey

Please send updates for future meetings or additional information.





Antelope Valley and Smithneck Creek Wildlife Areas  
Land Management Plan  
Draft Land Management Plan and  
Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration  
**PUBLIC COMMENTS**

*(please hand in or mail back by December 5, 2007)*

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Organization (if any): \_\_\_\_\_

Address (optional) : \_\_\_\_\_

City, State, Zip: \_\_\_\_\_

E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_

---

The California Department of Fish and Game (DFG) is preparing a Land Management Plan and an Initial Study (IS) for the Antelope Valley and Smithneck Creek Wildlife Areas. DFG invites you to provide specific comments on the scope of issues or topics to be addressed in the Land Management Plan.

If there is information which you believe should be incorporated into the Land Management Plan, or if you have any comments, please provide them below. Thank you!

**Comments** \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

**Comments continued** \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

